

---

9 August 2006

## Member State Positions on Security Council Reform

Although progress on Security Council reform has been slow to date, there is a strong consensus that the status quo is not a viable option in both composition and working methods reform. Controversy and disagreement have developed over the manner of achieving reform. Below is a brief summary of the most popular draft resolutions being considered at the moment:

- **G-4 Proposal** – calls for 6 new permanent seats, one for each of the G-4 countries (Brazil, Germany, India, and Japan) as well as two seats for Africa and 4 new non-permanent seats; the question of the extension of veto is deferred to a later date.
- **African Union Proposal** – calls for 6 new permanent seats, 2 for Africa, 2 for Asia, one for Latin America, and one for Western Europe, and 5 new non-permanent seats, including 2 more for Africa; the new permanent members would be given the same privileges as current permanent members including the veto.
- **Uniting for Consensus Proposal** – calls for 10 new non-permanent members chosen on a rotating basis by regional groups, including 3 new seats for Africa, 3 new seats for Asia, 2 new seats for Latin America, and one new seat for Western Europe and Eastern Europe; it also calls for restraint in the use of the veto by the current permanent members.
- **S-5 Proposal** – calls for reform of the working methods of the Security Council, including limiting the use of veto in cases of genocide and serious human rights violations, further consultations between members and non-members, particularly troop-contributing countries, and other reforms to increase transparency and accountability. The S-5 are Costa Rica, Jordan, Liechtenstein, Singapore, and Switzerland.

Below is a chart outlining Member State positions on this contentious issue based on the informal consultations held in the plenary on 20 and 21 July 2006. Statements are accessible by clicking on the name of the Member States for those states that provided them.

Member State	Expansion		Working Method Reform		Veto				
	Permanent Seats	Non-Permanent Seats		S-5 Proposal	Other Suggestions	Abolish it	Keep it	Limit its Use	
Algeria	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes		reform must be simultaneous with expansion		extend it to new permanent members	
Andorra		does not mention a change in composition		yes	yes			limit its use in cases of genocide and serious human rights violations	
<a href="#">Argentina</a>	yes	no	yes, 10 new seats	yes			yes	restraint on use of veto (for now)	
Armenia	yes		yes, with 1 new seat for Eastern Europe	yes					
<a href="#">Australia</a>	yes	yes, supports seats for India and Japan	yes, in a limited manner	yes	welcomes it as part of dialogue			no new vetoes	
Belgium	yes	supports a change in composition but does not specify how		yes	welcomes it as part of dialogue			yes, through modalities for its use	
Benin	yes	yes, supports new seats for G-4 and Africa	yes	yes		reform should not be hindered by divisions over expansion		veto must be reviewed	
Bhutan	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats	yes				no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
<a href="#">Botswana</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes		increased transparency and consultations with non-members		extend it to new permanent members	

<a href="#">Brazil</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats	yes	considers the note a partial solution	reform must be simultaneous with expansion		no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
Bulgaria	yes		yes, 1 new seat for Eastern Europe	yes		regional groups should have greater say in regional issues			
Chile	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes		eventually	no new vetoes	limit its use for issues such as genocide and crimes against humanity
<a href="#">China</a>	yes		yes, increasing the number of developing countries	yes	welcomes it as part of dialogue				
<a href="#">Colombia</a>	yes	no	yes, supports Uniting for Consensus proposal	yes					restraint on use of veto
Costa Rica	yes	supports a change in composition but does not specify how		yes	yes	reform should be addressed separately from expansion	eventually		limit its use in cases of genocide and serious human rights violations
Cuba	yes	yes, 2 new seats for Africa, 2 seats for Asia, and 2 seats for Latin America	yes	yes				extend it to new permanent members	
<a href="#">Cyprus</a>	yes	supports a more equitable regional balance		yes	supports some elements				
<a href="#">Czech Republic</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, increasing the number of developing countries	yes				no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
<a href="#">Denmark</a>	yes	yes, supports regional balance	yes, supports regional balance	yes		increase transparency, and consultations with non-members			

Ecuador	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal as well as others	yes	yes				no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
<a href="#">Egypt</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes	good first step	reform must be simultaneous with expansion; selection of the Secretary-General should be made more transparent			veto must be limited in cases of genocide and human rights violations, but also in calling for a ceasefire between two belligerents and SG selection process
<a href="#">El Salvador</a>	yes	supports a gradual process without specifying compositional changes		yes		reform working methods first to facilitate trust			
<a href="#">Ethiopia</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes				extend it to new permanent members	
<a href="#">Fiji</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes	yes				no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
Finland	yes	yes	yes	yes				no new vetoes	
France	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats with better regional balance	yes				no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
<a href="#">Germany</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats with better regional balance	yes	yes, but not sufficient without structural reform			no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	

<a href="#">Ghana</a>	yes	yes, African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes				extend it to new permanent members	
<a href="#">Greece</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats	yes	take note of this proposal			no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
<a href="#">Guatemala</a>	yes	yes	yes	yes	should be explored further				
<a href="#">Honduras</a>		does not mention a change in composition		yes		greater participation of non-member states in SC			
<a href="#">Iceland</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats	yes		increased transparency		no new vetoes (at least until the veto is reviewed)	
India	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats	yes		reform must be simultaneous with expansion			
Indonesia	yes	supports change of composition but does not specify how		yes		more consultations between members and non-members; better relationship with troop-providers; greater transparency in SG selection			
Iraq	yes	yes	yes	yes		increase outside state involvement; improve sanctions regimes			limit use to issues under chapter 7; should not be used in cases of genocide or serious crimes against humanity

<a href="#">Italy</a>	yes	no	yes, supports Uniting for Consensus proposal	yes		early reform and flexible positions			restraint on the use of veto
<a href="#">Jamaica</a>	yes	yes	yes	yes		greater transparency in SG selection	eventually	no new vetoes	limit use of veto in cases involving civilians and civilian infrastructure
<a href="#">Japan</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 framework but calls for a new proposal	yes	yes	calls it a good start	reform should not be hindered by divisions over expansion			
Jordan	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	reform should be addressed separately from expansion			limit use of veto in cases of genocide or serious human rights violations
Kazakhstan	yes	yes	yes	yes	deserves further examination				
Laos	yes	yes, supports regional balance and new seat for Africa	yes						
Libya	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes		its responsibility should be shared with the GA		extend veto to new permanent members	
<a href="#">Liechtenstein</a>	yes	does not support any of the current resolutions but would like to see new ideas developed		yes	yes, this should be adopted before expansion				
<a href="#">Malaysia</a>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	reform should be addressed separately from expansion	eventually		veto should be strongly regulated

Maldives	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal (flexible)	yes, 4 new seats (flexible)	yes				no new vetoes (at least until veto is reviewed)	
Malta	yes	no	yes, supports rotational regional seats (flexible)	yes	good contribution	reform must be simultaneous with expansion			limit its use
<a href="#">Mauritius</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes				extend veto to new permanent members	
<a href="#">Mexico</a>	yes	no	yes, any solution should be flexible	yes		increase transparency and accountability			
<a href="#">Mongolia</a>	yes	yes, supports seats for India, Japan, and Germany	yes	yes	yes	more open relationship with the GA			
Morocco	yes	stresses that divisions should not get in the way of working method reform		yes	good contribution	reform should not be hindered by expansion			
<a href="#">Myanmar</a>	yes	yes, increasing representation of developing world	yes, increasing representation of developing world	yes	good start	increase transparency of the subsidiary bodies also			
Nauru	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats	no		not without expansion first		no new vetoes	
<a href="#">Nepal</a>	yes	yes, supports seats for G-4 and Africa	yes	yes	supports some elements				
<a href="#">Netherlands</a>	yes	no	yes, any solution should be flexible	yes	good contribution to be included with expansion			any new veto should be temporary and reviewed	

<a href="#">New Zealand</a>	yes	yes, must include seat for Japan	yes	yes	yes	more consultations with non-members and monitoring of decisions			
Nicaragua	yes	will support any resolution that comes out with a clear consensus reflecting regional balance		yes					
<a href="#">Nigeria</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes	no		not without expansion first			
<a href="#">Norway</a>	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes	increased cooperation between SC and GA		no new veto	restraint on use of veto
Pakistan	yes	no	yes, supports Uniting for Consensus proposal	yes					restraint on the use of veto
<a href="#">Peru</a>	yes	yes, according to the current P-5's wishes	yes	yes				no new vetoes	limit use of veto in cases of genocide or serious human rights violations
<a href="#">Poland</a>	yes	yes, supports the countries who make the most contributions	yes, 1 new seat for Eastern Europe	yes	welcomes proposal as part of dialogue	closer cooperation with GA and regional groups; review situation in 15 years		no new vetoes	resume discussion
<a href="#">Portugal</a>	yes	yes	yes	yes		reform and expansion are part of the same process		extend it to new permanent members	
<a href="#">Qatar</a>	yes	yes, more seats for the developing world	yes, more seats for the developing world	yes			possibly		limit its use on the issue of civilians in Lebanon and the Occupied Territories
<a href="#">Republic of Korea</a>	yes	no	yes, supports Uniting for Consensus proposal	yes	yes				restraint on the use of veto
Romania	yes		yes, 1 new seat for Eastern Europe			reform is not sufficient			



Russian Federation	yes	will consider any proposal adopted by consensus		yes		will consider any proposal adopted by consensus		no new vetoes	
San Marino	yes	supports change of the composition, but does not specify how		yes	good step, but not enough				
<a href="#">Saudi Arabia</a>	yes	yes	yes	yes					
<a href="#">Senegal</a>	yes	yes, African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes				extend it to new permanent members	
<a href="#">Singapore</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 proposal	yes, 4 new seats	yes	welcomes it as part of dialogue		gradually	no new vetoes (at least until veto is reviewed)	
<a href="#">Slovakia</a>	yes	yes, supports seats for Japan and Germany	yes	yes					
<a href="#">Slovenia</a>	yes	yes	yes, 1 new seat for Eastern Europe	yes	yes				
Solomon Islands	yes	yes, supports elements of the G-4 proposal	yes	yes	supports some elements				
<a href="#">South Africa</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes	no	reform should occur simultaneously with expansion			
<a href="#">Spain</a>	yes	no	yes, 10 new seats	yes	yes				
<a href="#">Sri Lanka</a>	yes	yes, supports seats for G-4 and Africa	yes	yes	good step				
<a href="#">Sudan</a>	yes	supports a change in composition but does not specify how		yes		SC must not infringe on GA's responsibilities	yes		
<a href="#">Sweden</a>	yes	no	yes, subject to review	yes		increased transparency and accountability	eventually	no new vetoes	

<a href="#">Switzerland</a>	yes	supports a change in composition but does not specify how		yes	yes	reform should not be hindered by divisions over expansion		no new vetoes	limit its use in cases of genocide or serious human rights violations
<a href="#">Uganda</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes	yes		eventually	extend it to new permanent members until it is abolished	
<a href="#">United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland</a>	yes	yes, supports G-4 and 1 permanent seat for Africa	yes, 4 new seats	yes	welcomes the proposal as part of dialogue				
<a href="#">United Republic of Tanzania</a>	yes	yes, supports African Union proposal	yes, 5 new seats	yes	yes			extend it to new permanent members	
<a href="#">United States of America</a>	yes	yes, supports seat for Japan	yes	yes	no	Security Council should reform its own working methods			
<a href="#">Uruguay</a>	yes	yes, would be willing to support G-4 proposal (flexible)	yes	yes	yes			no new vetoes	limit its use in cases of genocide and serious human rights violations
<a href="#">Venezuela</a>	yes	yes, more seats for the developing world	yes, more seats for the developing world	yes		Security Council must limit its action	yes		limit its use
<a href="#">Viet Nam</a>	yes	yes, more seats for the developing world	yes, more seats for the developing world	yes	good basis for reform	increased transparency and accountability	eventually		limit its use to Chapter 7 issues